

IEEE Guide for Direct Lightning Stroke Shielding of Substations

IEEE Power and Energy Society

Sponsored by the
Substations Committee

IEEE
3 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10016-5997
USA

IEEE Std 998™-2012
(Revision of
IEEE Std 998-1996)

30 April 2013

IEEE Std 998™-2012

(Revision of
IEEE Std 998-1996)

IEEE Guide for Direct Lightning Stroke Shielding of Substations

Sponsor

Substations Committee
of the
IEEE Power and Energy Society

Approved 5 December 2012

IEEE-SA Standards Board

Grateful acknowledgements

Figure 1 and Annex G, Copyright © 2008 IEEE. Reprinted with permission from Orrell, J. T., “Direct Stroke Lightning Protection,” paper presented at EEI Electrical System and Equipment Committee Meeting, Washington, D.C., 25 Oct. 1988.

Figure 2 adapted from *Electrical Transmission and Distribution Reference Book*, by Central Station Engineers of the Westinghouse Electric Corporation, 4th ed., East Pittsburgh, PA, 1964.

Figures 6, 8, and 9 from MacGorman, D. R., M. W. Maier, and W. D. Rust, “Lightning Strike Density for the Contiguous United States from Thunderstorm Duration Record,” report no. NUREG/CR-3759, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, Norman, OK, May 1984.

Figure 7 from Meteorological Division, Department of Transportation, Canada. Copyright © Environment Canada, used with permission.

The IEEE thanks the Vaisala, Inc. for permission to reproduce the Vaisala image: Graph of USA ground 3 flash density as shown in Figure 10.

Figure 22 Copyright © 1972 IEEE. Reprinted with permission from Sargent, M. A., “The Frequency Distribution of Current Magnitudes of Lightning Strokes to Tall Structures,” *IEEE Transactions on Power Apparatus and Systems*, vol. 91, no. 5, pp. 2224–2229, 1972.

Figures 30 and 31 Copyright © 1998 IEEE. Reprinted with permission from Mousa, A. M., “The Applicability of Lightning Elimination Devices to Substations and Power Lines,” *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 13, pp. 1120–1127, 1998.

Figure 32 Copyright © 1987 IEEE. Reprinted with permission from Eriksson, A. J., “An Improved Electrogeometric Model for Transmission Line Shielding Analysis,” *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 871–886, July 1987.

Figures 44 and 45 Copyright © 1990 IEEE. Reprinted with permission from Deller, L. Garbagnati E., “Lightning Stroke Simulation by Means of the Leader Progression Model. Part I. Description of the Model and Evaluation of Exposure of Free-Standing Structures,” *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 5, pp. 2009–22, 1990.

Figure 46 from CIGRE Task Force 33.01.03, “Lightning Exposure of Structures and Interception Efficiency of Air Terminals,” Paris: CIGRE, Technical Brochure 118, Oct. 1997.

Figure 51 from the *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 39, 2006, Becerra, M. and Cooray, V., “A Self-Consistent Upward Leader Propagation Model,” is reproduced by permission of IOP Publishing. All rights reserved.

Figure C.1 reprinted with permission from *Transmission Line Reference Book 345 kV and Above*, Second Edition, Revised. Copyright © 1982, Electric Power Research Institute, Palo Alto, CA.

Abstract: Design information for the methods historically and typically applied by substation designers to reduce direct lightning strokes to equipment and buswork within substations is provided. Two approaches, the classical empirical method and the electrogeometric model, are presented in detail. A third approach, which involves the use of non-conventional lightning terminals and related design methods, is also reviewed.

Keywords: collection volume method (CVM), direct stroke shielding, electro-geometric model (EGM), field intensification factor method (FIFM), fixed angle, IEEE 998™, leader inception theory (LIT), leader progression model (LPM), lightning stroke protection, self-consistent leader inception and propagation model (SLIM), substations empirical curves

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2013 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
All rights reserved. Published 30 April 2013. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

PDF: ISBN 978-0-7381-8037-3 STD98031
Print: ISBN 978-0-7381-8038-0 STDPD98031

IEEE prohibits discrimination, harassment, and bullying. For more information, visit <http://www.ieee.org/web/aboutus/whatis/policies/p9-26.html>.

Notice and Disclaimer of Liability Concerning the Use of IEEE Documents: IEEE Standards documents are developed within the IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Standards Board. IEEE develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute, which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and serve without compensation. While IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

Use of an IEEE Standard is wholly voluntary. IEEE disclaims liability for any personal injury, property or other damage, of any nature whatsoever, whether special, indirect, consequential, or compensatory, directly or indirectly resulting from the publication, use of, or reliance upon any IEEE Standard document.

IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained in its standards, and expressly disclaims any express or implied warranty, including any implied warranty of merchantability or fitness for a specific purpose, or that the use of the material contained in its standards is free from patent infringement. IEEE Standards documents are supplied “**AS IS.**”

The existence of an IEEE Standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard. Every IEEE standard is subjected to review at least every ten years. When a document is more than ten years old and has not undergone a revision process, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE standard.

In publishing and making its standards available, IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity. Nor is IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing any IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her own independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

Translations: The IEEE consensus development process involves the review of documents in English only. In the event that an IEEE standard is translated, only the English version published by IEEE should be considered the approved IEEE standard.

Official Statements: A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, nor be relied upon as, a formal position of IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position of IEEE.

Comments on Standards: Comments for revision of IEEE Standards documents are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. However, IEEE does not provide consulting information or advice pertaining to IEEE Standards documents. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Since IEEE standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important to ensure that any responses to comments and questions also receive the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to comments or questions except in those cases where the matter has previously been addressed. Any person who would like to participate in evaluating comments or revisions to an IEEE standard is welcome to join the relevant IEEE working group at <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/wg/>.

Comments on standards should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board
445 Hoes Lane
Piscataway, NJ 08854
USA

Photocopies: Authorization to photocopy portions of any individual standard for internal or personal use is granted by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc., provided that the appropriate fee is paid to Copyright Clearance Center. To arrange for payment of licensing fee, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

Notice to users

Laws and regulations

Users of IEEE Standards documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of any IEEE Standards document does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standard are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so.

Copyrights

This document is copyrighted by the IEEE. It is made available for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use, by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making this document available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, the IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to this document.

Updating of IEEE documents

Users of IEEE Standards documents should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect. In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/index.html> or contact the IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE Standards Association or the IEEE standards development process, visit IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/index.html>.

Errata

Errata, if any, for this and all other standards can be accessed at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/findstds/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

Participants

At the time this IEEE guide was completed, the D5 Working Group had the following membership:

Robert S. Nowell, *Chair*
Sakis Meliopoulos, *Vice Chair*

Radoslav Barac	Keith Graham	Thomas Proios
Thomas Barnes	Joseph Gravelle	Donald Rogers
Hassein Bashirian	Steve Greenfield	Hamid Sharifnia
Bryan Beske	Charles Haahr	Boris Shvartsberg
James Cain	Thomas Harger	David Stamm
Bill Carman	Martin Havelka	Ryan Stargel
Kum S. Chan	Richard Keil	Brian Stephens
Koushik Chanda	Dave Kelley	Curtis Stidham
Randy Clelland	Cris Kramschuster	Brian Story
Franco D'Alessandro	Reginaldo Maniego	Keith Wallace
Dennis DeCosta	Mark Morgan	Don Wengerter
W. Bruce Dietzman	James T. Orrell	Alexander Wong
David Lane Garrett	Biren Patel	Yaowu Zhang

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this guide. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

William Ackerman	Michael Dood	Philip Hopkinson
Michael Adams	Douglas Dorr	Ronald Hotchkiss
Stan Arnot	Randall Dotson	Stephen Humeniuk
Thomas Barnes	Ernest Duckworth	Andrew Jones
George Becker	Donald Dunn	Lars Juhlin
Bryan Beske	Gary R. Engmann	Laszlo Kadar
Steven Bezner	C. Erven	Donald Kane
Wallace Binder	James Fairris	Richard Keil
Thomas Blackburn	Louis Farquhar	Dave Kelley
William Bloethe	Jorge Fernandez Daher	Gael Kennedy
Dale Boling	Michael Foley	Yuri Khersonsky
Paul Boman	David Lane Garrett	Chad Kiger
Dieter Braun	James Ghrist	James Kinney
Gustavo Brunello	David Giegel	Robert Kluge
Mark Bushnell	David Gilmer	Hermann Koch
James Cain	Waymon Goch	Joseph L. Koepfinger
Thomas Callsen	Jalal Gohari	Jim Kulchisky
Giuseppe Carbone	Edwin Goodwin	Saumen Kundu
Michael Champagne	James Graham	Donald Laird
Kum S. Chan	Keith Graham	Chung-Yiu Lam
Suresh Channarasappa	Joseph Gravelle	Benjamin Lanz
William Chisholm	Steve Greenfield	Thomas La Rose
Robert Christman	Randall Groves	Paul Lindemulder
Randy Clelland	Charles Haahr	Debra Longtin
Richard Cohen	Paul Hamer	Federico Lopez
Michael Comber	David Harris	Greg Luri
John Crouse	Martin Havelka	Michael Maytum
Chuanyou Dai	Steven Hensley	Omar Mazzoni
Franco D'Alessandro	Lee Herron	William McBride
Dennis DeCosta	Gary Heuston	John McDaniel
W. Bruce Dietzman	Raymond Hill	Gary Michel
Carlo Donati	Werner Hoelzl	Daleep Mohla
Gary Donner	Robert Hoerauf	Mark Morgan

Abdul Mousa
Jerry Murphy
Arun Narang
Arthur Neubauer
Michael S. Newman
Joe Nims
Gary Nissen
Robert S. Nowell
Hans-Wolf Oertel
Carl Orde
James T. Orrell
Lorraine Padden
Bansi Patel
Biren Patel
Shashi Patel
David Peelo
Emanuel Petrache
Christopher Petrola
Thomas Phipps
Donald Platts
Percy Pool
Alvaro Portillo
Douglas Proctor
Farhad Rachidi
Reynaldo Ramos

John Randolph
Marc Ressler
William Rison
Farouk A. M. Rizk
Michael Roberts
Charles Rogers
Marnie Roussell
Thomas Rozek
Bartien Sayogo
Dennis Schlender
Robert Schlesinger
Hamid Sharifnia
Devki Sharma
Soorya Shrestha
Gil Shultz
Hyeong Sim
Douglas Smith
James Smith
Jerry Smith
Rusty Soderberg
John Spare
David Stamm
Ryan Stargel
Brian Stephens
Gary Stoedter

Brian Story
K. B. Stump
Paul Sullivan
Antony Surtees
Leroy Taylor
David Tepen
William Thompson
John Toth
Harold VanSickle III
Luis Vargas
Raul Velazquez
John Vergis
Keith Wallace
David Wallach
Daniel Ward
Joe Watson
Yingli Wen
Donald Wengerter
Kenneth White
James Wilson
Alexander Wong
Larry Young
Roland Youngberg
Jian Yu
Luis Zambrano

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this guide on 5 December 2012, it had the following membership:

Richard H. Hulett, *Chair*
John Kulick, *Vice Chair*
Robert M. Grow, *Past Chair*
Konstantinos Karachalios, *Secretary*

Satish Aggarwal
Masayuki Ariyoshi
Peter Balma
William Bartley
Ted Burse
Clint Chaplin
Wael William Diab
Jean-Philippe Faure

Alexander Gelman
Paul Houzé
Jim Hughes
Joseph L. Koepfinger*
David J. Law
Thomas Lee
Hung Ling
Oleg Logvinov

Ted Olsen
Gary Robinson
Jon Walter Rosdahl
Sam Sciacca
Mike Seavey
Yatin Trivedi
Phil Winston
Don Wright

*Member Emeritus

Also included are the following nonvoting IEEE-SA Standards Board liaisons:

Richard DeBlasio, *DOE Representative*
Michael Janezic, *NIST Representative*

Don Messina
IEEE Standards Program Manager, Document Development

Erin Spiewak
IEEE Standards Program Manager, Technical Program Development

Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 998™-2012, IEEE Guide for Direct Lightning Stroke Shielding of Substations.

Work on the original guide began in 1973 and many former members made contributions toward its completion.

Working Group D5 of the IEEE PES Substations Committee began updating the guide in 2008. This guide provides information about various shielding methodologies to estimate and design direct lightning stroke shielding for outdoor substations. Calculation details, design estimates, and generally accepted practices for substation shielding designs are provided. This guide can be beneficial for engineers in evaluating direct lightning stroke shielding design for outdoor substations.

Dedication

This revision of IEEE Std 998 is dedicated to the memory of Gary R. Engmann. Gary through his membership in this working group and many others was always in the forefront with his statement “that the purpose of a guide is to disseminate information to practicing engineers.” Gary had a long association and leadership with the IEEE Substations Committee, NESC, IEEE-SA, and many other Technical Committees and Working Groups. He did not back away from tasks whether controversial or not. His leadership of the IEEE 998 “Bucket Brigade” was an insightful contribution to the development of this revision. His knowledge, humor, and keen insight into the day-to-day needs of all of us will be sorely missed.

Contents

1. Overview	1
1.1 Scope	1
1.2 Purpose	2
2. Definitions	2
3. Lightning phenomena	4
3.1 Charge formation in clouds	4
3.2 Stroke formation	5
3.3 Striking distance	7
3.4 First negative return stroke current magnitude	9
3.5 Keraunic level	11
3.6 Ground flash density	13
3.7 Lightning detection networks	15
4. The design problem	15
5. Empirical design methods	16
5.1 Fixed angles	16
5.2 Origin of empirical curves	18
5.3 Application of empirical curves	19
5.4 Areas protected by lightning masts	24
5.5 Effect of hillsides	26
6. The electrogeometric model (EGM)	26
6.1 History	26
6.2 Mousa's EGM	28
6.3 Application of the EGM by the rolling sphere method	31
6.4 Application of Mousa's EGM	38
6.5 Eriksson's EGM	39
6.6 Calculation of failure probability	48
7. Alternative models of lightning interception	48
7.1 Leader propagation models and methods for substation shielding	48
7.2 Importance of air terminal geometry	67
7.3 Active lightning terminals	67
Annex A (informative) Empirical shielding curves	69
Annex B (informative) Sample calculations	73
B.1 Introduction	73
B.2 Fixed-angle method	76
B.3 Empirical method	83
B.4 Electrogeometric model—rolling sphere method	93
B.5 The Eriksson EGM examples	118
B.6 Comparison of results of sample calculations and new methods and models	165
Annex C (informative) Calculation of corona radius and surge impedance under corona	167
C.1 Corona radius	167
C.2 Equivalent radius for bundle conductor	168
C.3 Surge impedance under corona	169

Annex D (informative) Risk evaluation	170
D.1 Introduction	170
D.2 Sample calculation.....	170
Annex E (informative) IEEE Questionnaire—2007	173
Annex F (informative) The Dainwood method	175
Annex G (informative) Direct stroke lightning protection	176
Annex H (informative) Methodology review	194
H.1 Introduction	194
H.2 Qualitative description of the models	194
H.3 Engineering analysis methods.....	195
H.4 Assumptions	196
H.5 Description of the methods	196
Annex I (informative) Comparison of IEEE Std 998 to other standards	201
I.1 Comparison of IEEE Std 1243-1997 and IEEE Std 998	201
I.2 Comparison of IEEE Std 1410-2004 and IEEE 998.....	202
I.3 Comparison of IEC 62305 and IEEE Std 998	204
Annex J (informative) Bibliography.....	208

IEEE Guide for Direct Lightning Stroke Shielding of Substations

IMPORTANT NOTICE: IEEE Standards documents are not intended to ensure safety, health, or environmental protection, or ensure against interference with or from other devices or networks. Implementers of IEEE Standards documents are responsible for determining and complying with all appropriate safety, security, environmental, health, and interference protection practices and all applicable laws and regulations.

This IEEE document is made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers appear in all publications containing this document and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Documents.” They can also be obtained on request from IEEE or viewed at <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/disclaimers.html>.

1. Overview

1.1 Scope

This guide identifies and discusses design procedures to provide direct stroke shielding of outdoor distribution, transmission, and generating plant substations. Known methods of shielding from direct strokes were investigated during the preparation of this guide, and information is provided on two methods found to be widely used:

- a) The classical empirical method
- b) The electrogeometric model

A third approach, which involves the use of non-conventional lightning terminals and related design methods, is also reviewed.

This guide does not purport to include all shielding methods that may have been developed. The guide also does not address protection from surges entering a substation over power or communication lines or the personnel safety issues.

Users of this guide should thoroughly acquaint themselves with all factors that relate to the design of a particular installation and use good engineering judgment in the application of the methods given here, particularly with respect to the importance and value of the equipment being protected.