

IEEE Recommended Practice for Verification, Validation, and Accreditation of a Federation—An Overlay to the High Level Architecture Federation Development and Execution Process

Sponsor
Simulation Interoperability Standards Committee
of the
IEEE Computer Society

Approved 27 September 2007
IEEE-SA Standards Board

Abstract: This recommended practice defines the processes and procedures that should be followed to implement Verification, Validation, and Accreditation (VV&A) for federations being developed using the High Level Architecture (HLA) Federation Development and Execution Process (FEDEP). This recommended practice is not intended to replace existing VV&A policies, procedures and guidance, but rather is intended to focus on the unique aspects of VV&A of federations. It is a higher-level framework into which such practices can be integrated and tailored for specific uses. The VV&A Overlay provides implementation-level guidance to VV&A practitioners.

Keywords: federate, federation, Federation Development and Execution Process, FEDEP, High Level Architecture, HLA, Verification, Validation, and Accreditation, VV&A

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2007 by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
All rights reserved. Published 20 December 2007. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

PDF: ISBN 978-0-7381-5697-2 STD95728
Print: ISBN 978-0-7381-5698-9 STDPD95728

No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

IEEE Standards documents are developed within the IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Standards Board. The IEEE develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute, which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and serve without compensation. While the IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, the IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information contained in its standards.

Use of an IEEE Standard is wholly voluntary. The IEEE disclaims liability for any personal injury, property or other damage, of any nature whatsoever, whether special, indirect, consequential, or compensatory, directly or indirectly resulting from the publication, use of, or reliance upon this, or any other IEEE Standard document.

The IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained herein, and expressly disclaims any express or implied warranty, including any implied warranty of merchantability or fitness for a specific purpose, or that the use of the material contained herein is free from patent infringement. IEEE Standards documents are supplied **“AS IS.”**

The existence of an IEEE Standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE Standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard. Every IEEE Standard is subjected to review at least every five years for revision or reaffirmation. When a document is more than five years old and has not been reaffirmed, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE Standard.

In publishing and making this document available, the IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity. Nor is the IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing this, and any other IEEE Standards document, should rely upon the advice of a competent professional in determining the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances.

Interpretations: Occasionally questions may arise regarding the meaning of portions of standards as they relate to specific applications. When the need for interpretations is brought to the attention of IEEE, the Institute will initiate action to prepare appropriate responses. Since IEEE Standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important to ensure that any interpretation has also received the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to interpretation requests except in those cases where the matter has previously received formal consideration. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position, explanation, or interpretation of the IEEE.

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Comments on standards and requests for interpretations should be addressed to:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board
445 Hoes Lane
Piscataway, NJ 08854
USA

Authorization to photocopy portions of any individual standard for internal or personal use is granted by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc., provided that the appropriate fee is paid to Copyright Clearance Center. To arrange for payment of licensing fee, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 1516.4-2007, IEEE Recommended Practice for Verification, Validation, and Accreditation of a Federation—An Overlay to the High Level Architecture Federation Development and Execution Process.

The High Level Architecture (HLA) facilitates interoperability among simulations and promotes reuse of simulations and their components. The HLA is composed of three major components and has an accompanying Federation Development and Execution Process (FEDEP) model:

- *HLA Framework and Rules*: A set of rules that describe the general principles defining the HLA. (IEEE Std 1516TM-2000)
- *HLA Federate Interface Specification*: A description of the interface between simulations (federates) and the HLA runtime infrastructure. (IEEE Std 1516.1TM-2000)
- *HLA Object Model Template Specification*: A specification for documenting HLA object models. (IEEE Std 1516.2TM-2000)
- *HLA Federation Development and Execution Process*: A description of the process for constructing and executing HLA federations. (IEEE Std 1516.3TM-2003)

The HLA FEDEP (IEEE Std 1516.3-2003) is a recommended practice that describes a generalized process for building and executing HLA federations. It does not replace the existing management and development methodologies of HLA user organizations, but rather provides a high-level framework into which other systems engineering practices can be easily integrated. The FEDEP defines a methodology that can and should be tailored to meet the needs of user applications.

This recommended practice provides guidelines for verifying, validating, and accrediting a federation. Its purpose is to provide a more detailed view of the VV&A processes implied by the FEDEP.

This recommended practice defines the processes and procedures that should be followed to implement VV&A for federations being developed using the FEDEP. It is not intended to replace existing VV&A policies, procedures, and guidance, but rather is intended to focus on the unique aspects of VV&A of federations.

This recommended practice provides implementation-level guidance to VV&A practitioners by interpreting and customizing the more generalized FEDEP activity descriptions. It focuses upon the VV&A processes that apply to federations and not the VV&A processes associated with individual federates, but does incorporate the use of the information produced by those processes. Furthermore, the recommended practice does not describe the individual verification or validation techniques that could be employed to execute the VV&A processes for federations.

This recommended practice has been designed to apply across a wide range of functional applications. Currently, these processes represent the best practices available to the VV&A community. Just like the FEDEP, this recommended practice is not intended to be prescriptive for all FEDEP users. Rather, it is a tailorable process and is offered as guidance to all participants in FEDEP activities. Users and developers of other synthetic simulation environments that are not based on HLA can also benefit from the guidance provided in this recommended practice, as the VV&A activities can be tailored as necessary to support nearly any type of distributed simulation application.

Notice to users

Errata

Errata, if any, for this and all other standards can be accessed at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/reading/ieee/updates/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

Interpretations

Current interpretations can be accessed at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/reading/ieee/interp/index.html>.

Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patent Claims or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

Participants

At the time this recommended practice was submitted to the IEEE-SA Standards Board for approval, the Verification, Validation, and Accreditation Overlay to the Federation Development and Execution Process Working Group had the following membership:

Simone M. Youngblood, *Chair*

Susan D. Solick, *Vice-chair*

Scott Y. Harmon, *Editor*

Marcy A. Stutzman, *Assistant Editor*

Joanne Atherton
Michael R. Bachmann
Curzio Batini
Mark Biwer
Curtis Blais
Pierre Bouc
Mathew Brown
Timothy Byram
Lisa Caine
Jerry Feinberg
Masakazu Furuichi

Robert Gravitz
David C. Gross
Michael Hambley
James W. Hollenbach
Jean-Louis Igarza
Fredrik Jonsson
Rosemarie Keener
Wayne Lindo
James M. McCall

Lana McGlynn
William Oates
Shel Ocasio
Jennifer Park
Mikel Petty
Graham C. Shanks
William Spooner
Masahiko Tanimoto
Ad C. van Lier
Daniel Verret
William H. Zimmerman

The Working Group would like to especially acknowledge these individuals that contributed to the preparation of this recommended practice as follows:

Jack A. Borah
Dirk Brade
Colin Brain
Ingo Cegla

Virginia Dobey
Mark Dumble
Grayden Figart
Daniel Girardot

René Jacquart
Håkan Lagerström
Robert O. Lewis
Gary M. Lightner

Robert R. Lutz
Anthony J. Masys
Michael L. Metz
Susan Moore

Linda Olson
Siegfried Pohl
Bob Senko

Michael Simpson
Bob Strausser
Cindy Sullivan
Choong-ho Yi

The following members of the balloting committee voted on this recommended practice. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

Michael R. Bachmann
Jack A. Borah
Keith Chow
Tommy P. Cooper
Uwe Dobrindt
David R. Elliott
Masakazu Furuichi
Allan M. Gillard
Jaganathan Gnanavelu
David C. Gross
Randall C. Groves
Steve Hamilton
Scott Y. Harmon
Rutger A. Heunks
Mark J. Knight
Thomas M. Kurihara

Gary M. Lightner
Margaret L. Loper
William Lumpkins
G. Luri
Robert R. Lutz
Faramarz Maghsoodlou
Anthony J. Masys
Edward M. McCall
James M. McCall
Michael L. Metz
Gary L. Michel
William Milam
Thomas H. Mullins
Michael S. Newman
Jonathan R. Prescott

Robert A. Robinson
Michael D. Rush
Peter J. Ryan
Geoffrey C. Sauerborn
Randy Saunders
Graham C. Shanks
Susan D. Solick
Thomas E. Starai
Dennis E. Stevenson
Marcy A. Stutzman
Mark A. Tillinghast
S. Tulasidas
Thomas A. Tullia
Simone M. Youngblood
Janusz Zalewski
William H. Zimmerman

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this recommended practice on 27 September 2007, it had the following membership:

Steve M. Mills, *Chair*
Robert M. Grow, *Vice Chair*
Don Wright, *Past Chair*
Judith Gorman, *Secretary*

Richard DeBlasio
Alex Gelman
William R. Goldbach
Arnold M. Greenspan
Joanna N. Guenin
Julian Forster*
Kenneth S. Hanus
William B. Hopf

Richard H. Hulett
Hermann Koch
Joseph L. Koepfinger*
John Kulick
David J. Law
Glenn Parsons
Ronald C. Petersen
Tom A. Prevost

Narayanan Ramachandran
Greg Ratta
Robby Robson
Anne-Marie Sahazizian
Virginia C. Sulzberger
Malcolm V. Thaden
Richard L. Townsend
Howard L. Wolfman

*Member Emeritus

Also included are the following nonvoting IEEE-SA Standards Board liaisons:

Satish K. Aggarwal, *NRC Representative*
Alan H. Cookson, *NIST Representative*

Lorraine Patsco
IEEE Standards Program Manager, Document Development

Michael D. Kipness
IEEE Standards Program Manager, Technical Program Development

CONTENTS

1. Overview	1
1.1 Scope	1
1.2 Purpose	1
1.3 Conventions	2
2. Normative references.....	4
3. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations	4
3.1 Definitions	4
3.2 Special terms.....	5
3.3 Acronyms and abbreviations	6
4. Federation VV&A roles and responsibilities.....	6
5. Overlay assumptions and tailoring	10
5.1 Assumptions	10
5.2 Tailoring	10
6. VV&A Overlay model: top-level view.....	11
7. VV&A Overlay model: detailed view	12
7.1 Phase 1—Verify federation objectives	14
7.2 Phase 2—Verify and validate federation conceptual model	24
7.3 Phase 3—Verify federation design	33
7.4 Phase 4—Verify federation development products	39
7.5 Phase 5—Validate and accept federation	50
7.6 Phase 6—Verify and validate federation output	59
7.7 Phase 7—Consolidate federation VV&A products	62
8. Conclusion.....	65
Annex A (informative) Bibliography	66

IEEE Recommended Practice for Verification, Validation, and Accreditation of a Federation—An Overlay to the High Level Architecture Federation Development and Execution Process

1. Overview

1.1 Scope

This recommended practice defines the processes and procedures that should be followed to implement Verification, Validation, and Accreditation¹ (VV&A) for federations being developed using the High Level Architecture (HLA) Federation Development and Execution Process (FEDEP). This recommended practice is not intended to replace existing VV&A policies, procedures, and guidance, but rather is intended to focus on the unique aspects of the VV&A of federations. It provides a higher-level framework into which such practices can be integrated and tailored for specific uses. The VV&A Overlay provides implementation-level guidance to VV&A practitioners; however, it does not describe the individual techniques that might be employed to execute the VV&A processes for federations.

This VV&A Overlay focuses upon the VV&A processes that apply to federations and not the VV&A processes associated with individual simulations (federates), but does consider using the information produced by those processes.

Users, developers, and VV&A personnel working with simulations and simulation compositions not based upon the HLA and the FEDEP can also benefit from the guidance in this document since the activities that this overlay describes can be tailored to support any type of distributed simulation application.

1.2 Purpose

The VV&A Overlay has been designed to apply across a wide range of functional applications. The purpose of this overlay is to provide a more detailed view of the VV&A processes implied by the FEDEP. Currently, these processes represent the best practices available to the VV&A community. The VV&A Overlay is a tailorable process and is offered as guidance to all participants in FEDEP activities.

¹ Note that outside of the United States there may not be a formal accreditation process and the terms “acceptance” or “accepted for use” may be used; in this document the term acceptance is the decision to use a model, simulation, or federation of models and simulations for a specific purpose and the term accreditation is the official certification that a model, simulation, or federation of models and simulations is acceptable for use for a specific purpose. For the purposes of this document the terms are equivalent.