

# IEEE Guide for Power System Protection Testing

Sponsor

**IEEE Power System Relaying Committee**

of the

**IEEE Power & Energy Society**

Approved 11 September 2009

**IEEE-SA Standards Board**

**Abstract:** Test approaches and procedures for the components and the overall protection and control system functions are presented. Test of equipment in the system protection scheme, associated communications equipment, auxiliary power supplies, and the control of power apparatus are addressed. Much of the testing emphasizes a bottom-up approach, in which the basic behavior of scheme components are verified first, followed by testing of interconnected components in a function-oriented assembly.

**Keywords:** application testing, commissioning testing, design testing, maintenance testing, performance assessment

---

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.  
3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2009 by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.  
All rights reserved. Published 11 December 2009. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

**PDF: ISBN 978-0-7381-6080-1 STD95978**  
**Print: ISBN 978-0-7381-6081-8 STDPD95978**

*No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.*

**IEEE Standards** documents are developed within the IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Standards Board. The IEEE develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute, which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and serve without compensation. While the IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, the IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

Use of an IEEE Standard is wholly voluntary. The IEEE disclaims liability for any personal injury, property or other damage, of any nature whatsoever, whether special, indirect, consequential, or compensatory, directly or indirectly resulting from the publication, use of, or reliance upon this, or any other IEEE Standard document.

The IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained herein, and expressly disclaims any express or implied warranty, including any implied warranty of merchantability or fitness for a specific purpose, or that the use of the material contained herein is free from patent infringement. IEEE Standards documents are supplied “**AS IS.**”

The existence of an IEEE Standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE Standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard. Every IEEE Standard is subjected to review at least every five years for revision or reaffirmation. When a document is more than five years old and has not been reaffirmed, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE Standard.

In publishing and making this document available, the IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity. Nor is the IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing this, and any other IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

Interpretations: Occasionally questions may arise regarding the meaning of portions of standards as they relate to specific applications. When the need for interpretations is brought to the attention of IEEE, the Institute will initiate action to prepare appropriate responses. Since IEEE Standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important to ensure that any interpretation has also received the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to interpretation requests except in those cases where the matter has previously received formal consideration. A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, nor be relied upon as, a formal interpretation of the IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position, explanation, or interpretation of the IEEE.

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Comments on standards and requests for interpretations should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board  
445 Hoes Lane  
Piscataway, NJ 08854  
USA

Authorization to photocopy portions of any individual standard for internal or personal use is granted by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc., provided that the appropriate fee is paid to Copyright Clearance Center. To arrange for payment of licensing fee, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

## Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std C37.233-2009, IEEE Guide for Power System Protection Testing.

This guide focuses on the general approach and specific procedures for testing protective relaying systems that include multiple interacting relay components, auxiliary devices, and power apparatus. In the most critical applications, these system devices may interact over an extended physical or geographic area and use communications systems. The procedures focus separately on design testing, commissioning testing, routine maintenance testing, and ongoing performance assessment with a discussion of what each of these test categories aims to accomplish.

## Notice to users

### Laws and regulations

Users of these documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of this standard does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standard are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so.

### Copyrights

This document is copyrighted by the IEEE. It is made available for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use, by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making this document available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, the IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to this document.

### Updating of IEEE documents

Users of IEEE standards should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect. In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE Standards Association Web site at <http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp>, or contact the IEEE at the address listed previously.

For more information about the IEEE Standards Association or the IEEE standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Web site at <http://standards.ieee.org>.

## Errata

Errata, if any, for this and all other standards can be accessed at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/reading/ieee/updates/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

## Interpretations

Current interpretations can be accessed at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/reading/ieee/interp/index.html>.

## Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this guide may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this guide, no position is taken with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this guide are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

## Participants

At the time this guide was submitted to the IEEE-SA Standards Board for approval, the Power System Protection Testing Working Group had the following membership:

**Vahid Madani**, *Chair*  
**Hyder DoCarmo**, *Vice Chair*

Marc Achterkamp  
Mark Adamiak  
Mike Agudo  
Alexander Apostolov  
James Ariza  
Miroslav Begovic  
Robert Beresh  
Gustavo Brunello  
Dac-Phouc Bui  
Sean Chilcote  
Guy Colpron

Ratan Das  
Kelly Gardner  
Daniel Goodrich  
Anthony Giuliante  
Gene Henneberg  
Rich Hunt  
Bogdan Kasztenny  
Tim Kern  
Mladen Kezunovic  
Gary L. Kobet  
Peter McLaren  
Michael Mendik

Kalyan Mustaphi  
Damir Novosel  
Farnoosh Rahmatian  
André Santos  
Tony Seegers  
Jon Sykes  
Eric Udren  
Alfredo Vaccaro  
Benton A. Vandiver  
Jun Verzosa  
Ilia Voloh

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this guide. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

William J. Ackerman	Roger Hedding	Joe Nims
Steven Alexanderson	Charles Henville	Gary Nissen
Alexander Apostolov	Lee Herron	Allan St. Peter
Stan Arnot	Gary Heuston	Craig Preuss
Ali Al Awazi	Scott Hietpas	Iulian Profir
Thomas Barnes	Jerry Hohn	Farnoosh Rahmatian
G. Bartok	Dennis Holstein	Madan Rana
David Basset	David Horvath	R. Rebbapragada
Thomas Basso	James Huddleston III	Michael Roberts
Robert Beresh	James Ingleson	Charles Rogers
Martin Best	Gerald Johnson	M. Sachdev
Steven Bezner	James Jones	Miriam Sanders
Wallace Binder	Innocent Kamwa	Steven Sano
Kenneth Birt	Bogdan Kasztenny	Daniel Sauer
William Bloethe	Gael Kennedy	Bartien Sayogo
Chris Brooks	Mladen Kezunovic	Thomas Schossig
Gustavo Brunello	Tanuj Khandelwal	Sam Sciacca
Hyder DoCarmo	Yuri Khersonsky	Tony Seegers
Arvind K. Chaudhary	Chad Kiger	Douglas Seely
Stephen Conrad	James Kinney	Gregory Sessler
Tommy Cooper	Gary L. Kobet	Devki Sharma
Jerry Corkran	Joseph L. Koepfinger	Gil Shultz
James Cornelison	David W. Krause	Tarlochan Sidhu
Ratan Das	Jim Kulchisky	David Smith
Alla Deronja	Saumen Kundu	James E. Smith
Gary L. Donner	Chung-Yiu Lam	Jerry Smith
Ernest Duckworth	Raluca Lascu	Kevin Stephan
Donald Dunn	Debra Longtin	Charles Sufana
Douglas J. Edwards	Federico Lopez	Richard Taylor
Gearold O. H. Eidhin	William Lowe	John Tengdin
Gary Engmann	Bruce Mackie	David Tepen
Keith Flowers	Vahid Madani	Demetrios Tziouvaras
Fredric Friend	O. Malik	Joe Uchiyama
Jeffrey Gilbert	Omar Mazzoni	Eric Udren
Anthony Giuliante	Gary Michel	Benton A. Vandiver
Jalal Gohari	Georges Montillet	John Vergis
Stephen Grier	Charles Morse	Jane Verner
Randall Groves	Jerry Murphy	Solveig Ward
Ajit Gwal	Dennis Nietzel	Kenneth White
	Michael S. Newman	

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this guide on 11 September 2009, it had the following membership:

**Robert M. Grow**, *Chair*  
**Thomas Prevost**, *Vice Chair*  
**Steve M. Mills**, *Past Chair*  
**Judith Gorman**, *Secretary*

John Barr	Alexander Gelman	David J. Law
Karen Bartleson	Jim Hughes	Ted Olsen
Victor Berman	Richard H. Hulett	Glenn Parsons
Ted Burse	Young Kyun Kim	Ronald C. Petersen
Richard DeBlasio	Joseph L. Koepfinger*	Narayanan Ramachandran
Andy Drozd	John Kulick	Jon Walter Rosdahl
Mark Epstein		Sam Sciacca

\*Member Emeritus

Also included are the following nonvoting IEEE-SA Standards Board liaisons:

Howard L. Wolfman, *TAB Representative*

Michael Janezic, *NIST Representative*

Satish K. Aggarwal, *NRC Representative*

Lorraine Patsco

IEEE Standards Program Manager, Document Development

Soo Kim

IEEE Standards Program Manager, Technical Program Development

## Contents

1. Overview .....	1
1.1 Scope .....	1
1.2 Purpose .....	1
1.3 General .....	2
1.4 Types of applications .....	2
1.5 Types of tests .....	3
1.6 Applications for systems, schemes, and multistation testing .....	5
1.7 Considerations for testing and scheme self-monitoring .....	7
2. Normative references .....	10
3. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations .....	11
3.1 Definitions .....	11
3.2 Acronyms and abbreviations .....	11
4. Types of tests .....	12
4.1 Certification tests .....	12
4.2 Application tests .....	13
4.3 Commissioning tests .....	14
4.4 Maintenance tests .....	15
4.5 Example of test setup configurations and equipment (end-to-end testing) .....	18
4.6 Methods for generating test modules and cases .....	21
4.7 Analyses and retention of test results .....	26
5. Benefits and justification for different types of tests .....	30
6. Description of types of relay schemes and testing requirements .....	31
6.1 Introduction .....	31
6.2 Line protection .....	32
6.3 Transformer protection .....	43
6.4 Distribution protection .....	49
6.5 Shunt capacitor protection .....	56
6.6 Bus protection .....	58
6.7 Breaker failure protection and control .....	59
6.8 Reactor protection .....	67
6.9 Generator protection .....	68
6.10 Trip circuit logic scheme .....	70
7. Protection system communication testing .....	74
7.1 Power-line carrier testing .....	74
7.2 Functional testing of IEC 61850-based substation automation systems .....	77
7.3 Wireless communication .....	82

8. SIPS test requirements.....	83
8.1 Proof-of-concept testing .....	86
8.2 Field commissioning tests.....	87
8.3 System-wide performance testing during maintenance intervals.....	87
8.4 Validation through state estimation .....	88
8.5 Automatic and manual periodic testing of the entire scheme .....	88
9. Testing protection and control systems with unconventional voltage and current sensing inputs.....	90
9.1 Testing inputs to relays and microprocessor-based devices with low-level analog inputs per IEEE Std C37.92™-2005 [B17].....	90
9.2 Testing inputs to relays with digital interfaces per IEC 61850-9-2-2004 [B13] process bus .....	91
9.3 Testing outputs of unconventional sensors .....	94
9.4 Verification by condition-based maintenance .....	96
Annex A (informative) Bibliography .....	97
Annex B (informative) Suggested line current differential scheme testing procedure .....	100
Annex C (informative) Impact of high-impedance faults to protective relay performance and system testing .....	105
Annex D (informative) Transformer oil and winding temperature computational methods .....	108
Annex E (informative) Measuring and compensating for time delay after trigger for performing end-to-end testing using different relay test sets.....	110



# IEEE Guide for Power System Protection Testing

***IMPORTANT NOTICE:*** *This guide is not intended to ensure safety, security, health, or environmental protection in all circumstances. Implementers of the guide are responsible for determining appropriate safety, security, environmental, and health practices or regulatory requirements.*

*This IEEE document is made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers appear in all publications containing this document and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Documents.” They can also be obtained on request from IEEE or viewed at <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/disclaimers.html>.*

## 1. Overview

### 1.1 Scope

This guide covers suggested test requirements for power system protection scheme testing, system application tests, the scope and level of tests based on the application, and benefits of the overall protective schemes testing. This guide encompasses overall system testing procedures (generators, line, line reactors, transformer, capacitors, special protection schemes, end-to-end testing, distributed application within substation, etc.) and data collection requirements, as well as the test procedure definitions. This guide describes the methods, extent, and types of system tests for protection applications at various voltage levels. Control functions inherent to the protective systems are included. Importance of line testing, indirect trip applications, open/closed-loop tests, and dynamic/nonlinear tests are also covered.

### 1.2 Purpose

This guide is intended for power system protection professionals. It includes a reference list of type tests for protective devices as well as overall protection scheme performance tests for various types of protection schemes. The guide describes the methods, extent, and types of protection scheme tests. Interlocking and control functions inherent to the protective schemes are included.